



UDC 332; DOI 10.18551/rjoas.2022-07.21

“SUSTAINABILITY MARKETING” TO SUPPORT SUSTAINABLE TOURISM IN BALI

Iswara Agus Made Yoga*

International Institute of Tourism and Business (IPB International), Bali, Indonesia

Astawa I Nengah Dasi

Universitas Pendidikan Nasional, Denpasar, Bali, Indonesia

Suyasa Darma, Diana Wira

International Institute of Tourism and Business (IPB International), Bali, Indonesia

ABSTRACT

This study aims to identify and evaluate the current marketing model of the tourism industry component in Bali, analyze the positive and negative impacts of the marketing model of the current tourism industry component in Bali, and arrange possible marketing model innovations in the tourism industry component in Bali. In this qualitative study, data were collected through interviews, observations, FGDs with marketers, literature review and internet site search for an accommodation business to see things related to marketing practices. The data is examined using the triple bottom line theory, legitimacy, stakeholders and agency. The positive impact of the current marketing model is economic growth, the achievement of Return on Investment, business continuity, and Increasing Market Share. The negative impacts are environmental and socio-cultural. The accommodation service provider industry in Bali currently mainly operates a marketing model that focuses on economic aspects, so an innovative marketing model is proposed to respond to the negative impacts caused by the marketing model currently applied by most accommodation businesses in Bali. The sustainable marketing innovation model is an innovative marketing model that is carried out to meet the performance of all stakeholders, including customers, and does not neglect the interests of future generations. Suggestions for marketing practitioners and the government are advised to transform the model so increasingly evident of their contribution to sustainable tourism development in Bali and to arrange the business in line with the marketing spirit of 7P +.

KEY WORDS

Sustainable marketing, Bali tourism, innovation.

Tourism has become a global industry that can encourage faster and cheaper economic sector growth. At least, that is the fact before the Covid-19 pandemic immediately stopped various forms of business, including the tourism industry. Evidence of the growth of the tourism sector before the pandemic can be seen in the growth in the number of people travelling worldwide from year to year. In addition to destination management, marketing or marketing is crucial to increase the number of visits. Sustainable tourism destinations, of course, also require a form of sustainable marketing (sustainability marketing) (Jauhari ed. 2014).

Tourism also has a snowballing effect in contributing to economic growth because the development of new tourism destinations is often accompanied by the emergence of new non-governmental organizations (Honey & Gilpin, 2009). In fact, in countries that rely on tourism as the locomotive of their development, tourism has a broad economic, social, cultural and environmental impact. The tourism sector generates services, products, foreign exchange, employment opportunities, business opportunities and investment.

The ideal tourism development has a concept that can minimize negative impacts so that it does not provide a burden for the next generation. This concept is known as sustainable tourism. Namely, tourism that takes complete account of the current and future economic, social and environmental impacts, addresses the needs of visitors and host



communities and preserves the environment. However, in reality, the sales concept is still oriented toward high profits. However, it is not concerned with customer satisfaction. At the same time, the marketing concept is more profit-oriented and emphasizes customer satisfaction, loyalty, and repurchase, without any attention to public welfare and environmental sustainability.

In discussing discourse and efforts to realize sustainable Bali tourism, the role of marketing and sellers (sales and marketing) has never been considered. In fact, as the party spearheads Bali's marketing, bringing in tourists, increasing the number of visits, and expanding the market share, marketing and sellers need to be awakened by awareness so that they have the same orientation as other tourism stakeholders in realizing sustainable tourism. At least, with increasing awareness and responsibility of marketers and sellers in the tourism accommodation business, there will be more and more strong pillars supporting Bali's sustainable tourism development program. 3-Ps. Starting from the 4-Ps, namely Product, Price, Promotion, and Place (McCarthy, 1960) and developed to become the 7-Ps, namely Product, Price, Promotion, Place, Participants, Physical Evidence and Process, the conventional strategy of marketing mix both 4-Ps and 7-Ps have not been able to answer the challenges regarding sustainable issues so that the marketing mix needs to be innovated by combining the 7-Ps marketing mix with three elements from the triple bottom line (TBL), namely people, planet and profit or in this study referred to as the sustainability model.

This research aims to produce a marketing model that micro-support the tourism accommodation service business and, at a macro level, contribute to realizing sustainable tourism development in Bali. As a basis for reviewing and analyzing the problem of limited sales and marketing support in realizing sustainable tourism in Bali, this study formulates three interrelated questions: 1) What is the marketing model for the accommodation business in the tourism industry in Bali today? 2) What are the positive or negative impacts of Bali's current tourism industry component marketing model? 3) What is the innovative marketing model for accommodation businesses in the tourism industry to support sustainable tourism development in Bali?

LITERATURE REVIEW

Research on the issue of sustainable tourism development in Bali focuses more on studying the impacts and benefits of tourism in environmental conservation, the benefits of tourism in providing economic benefits, and preserving socio-cultural development (Rahmawati et al. 2018; Bendesa and Aksari 2017; Putra and Paturusi 2017; Ardika 2007; Picard 2006; Pitana 2005; 2002). In general, almost none of these studies mention the role of marketing and marketers (marketing and marketers) as one of the spearheads in supporting sustainable tourism development. The side impression that arises from this research is that the business of marketing and marketers is only in seeking as many customers as possible, increasing market share, and making profits to please investors. This literature review explores this gap by studying how vital the role of marketing and marketers is in realizing sustainable tourism.

Picard (2006) and Ardika (2007) examine the cultural aspects of tourism, both in the form of art and cultural heritage (heritage) are also the main topics of research. Picard (2006) reviews tourism with a multidimensional approach, such as colonial history, when discussing Bali's tourism development since the Dutch era. He also studies Bali tourism with a sociological approach, especially the impact of commercialization and mass tourism development that threatens the cultural values of the Balinese people. Ardika (2007) states that sustainable development implies limits set by technology and community organizations as well as by the ability of earth's life to absorb the impact of human activities. Tourism is developed to meet the needs of tourists, the tourism industry, and local communities today without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs.

Burn and Holden (1997) state that sustainable tourism development must utilize natural resources optimally according to their carrying capacity so as not to cause damage, respect the socio-cultural environment of the local community, ensure sustainable economic benefits



and are distributed fairly to all stakeholders. The principles of sustainable tourism development are 1) maintaining environmental quality, 2) providing benefits for local communities and tourists, 3) maintaining the relationship between tourism and the environment, 4) maintaining harmony between local communities, tourist needs and the environment, 5) create dynamic conditions adapted to carrying capacity, and 6) all stakeholders must work together based on the same mission to realize sustainable development.

Similar to the thoughts of Burn and Holden (1997), the United Nations World Tourism Organization UNWTO (2011) also mentions that sustainable tourism development is based on several principles by emphasizing the compact role of all stakeholders in protecting the environment and cultural resources, carrying capacity. Robert (2008) also mentions that three essential things in sustainable tourism development are the concepts of quality, continuity, and balance. The economic aspect is not explicitly discussed, nor does it reach the marketing discussion.

Pomering et al. (2010) research in Tasmania combines a marketing mix strategy with a sustainable model. This research was conducted because the contemporary marketing mix strategy, both 4 Ps, 7 Ps and 8 Ps, have not been able to answer the challenges of sustainability marketing issues, so it is necessary to innovate by combining the three elements of the triple bottom line, namely; people, planet and profit. The limitation of Pomering et al.'s research is that this research is only a proposal, and its application has not been identified. This research continues to the implementation stage in each marketing mix component so that it can be used as an innovative sustainable tourism marketing model.

Thought in marketing concepts and practices evolved. In their research, Belz and Peattle (2010) emphasize that the conventional marketing mix is considered unable to answer the challenges of sustainability issues, so it is necessary to adopt the concept of sustainable development into a more beneficial marketing strategy for customers. Belz and Peattle propose the 4Cs of the sustainability marketing mix: customer solution, customer cost, convenience and communication. The limitation of this research is that it is still limited to the model proposal and the aspect focused on the 4Cs is the customer, which means that the planetary and social aspects of the sustainability concept have not been identified.

This research is also supported by four theories, namely, (1) the triple bottom line theory, (2) legitimacy theory, (3) stakeholder theory, and (4) agency theory. The theoretical basis of the triple bottom line is used as a grand theory in this study because the theory is also the basis for tourism marketing innovation which is expected to be a solution to the concept of sustainability. People, planet and profit or the triple bottom line, is a thought that has been developing for quite a long time in Europe. The supporting theory used as a reference in this study, namely the first, is the legitimacy theory, the second stakeholder theory, and the third agency theory. These three supporting theories describe how a company can change or run a sustainable tourism marketing innovation.

METHODS OF RESEARCH

This research is research with a qualitative approach. This dissertation is in the form of critical, descriptive research, critical, descriptive research, namely a critical study of specific social phenomena, in this case, the phenomenon of the marketing practice of accommodation service businesses in Bali. The results of this study describe or construct in-depth interviews and focus group discussions (FGD) on research subjects to provide a clear picture of understanding the innovation of sustainable tourism marketing models in Bali. This research was conducted in Bali, especially in the type of accommodation business. Data collection methods and techniques in this research are literature study, observation, in-depth interviews, and FGD. The experts in this study are representatives of the government, the tourism industry; the private sector, academics and the community who are selected based on their abilities and are considered relevant to the research problem. This study uses descriptive interpretative-critical data analysis.



RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The development of Bali tourism, as shown in the number of visits, the increasing number of accommodations, and the magnetism of Bali as a tourist attraction, is the joint result of stakeholders. What is rarely appreciated in particular is the role of marketers, perhaps because their role is seen narrowly as the front-line business officer or the spearhead of the business to make profits and continue to expand the market. If you think about it openly, the role of marketers is enormous to bring in tourists and expand market share. The role of marketers is not only in a positive sense but also in the opposite. Marketers are also responsible when there is a tariff war in the hotel industry or the emergence of a phenomenon that leads to an environmental crisis, excess capacity or carrying capacity leading to over-tourism. In this context, marketers need to carry out marketing strategies so that the idea of realizing Bali as a sustainable tourism destination can be realized. How marketing practices are applied by marketers of the accommodation industry in Bali, what are the advantages and disadvantages, and the ideal form of marketing is the subject of the following analysis.

This research found that three models of marketing components of the tourism industry exist in Bali: the Profit Direct Oriented Model, the Profit Indirect Oriented Model, and the Profit Mix Oriented Model. The division was made based on existing data such as; marketing collateral, website, depth interview, virtual guest comment and identification of prominent and similar characters so that they can be categorized into one group model. The first category of marketing models used in Bali, referred to as the profit direct oriented model, has salient characteristics in how communication is used to achieve profit or profit.

In marketing its products, one of the resorts in the Tuban area is promoting by highlighting significant price discounts for direct bookings. The 45% discount is written on the website and marketing collateral: "Book Direct Save Up to 45% with Extra Benefits!" The range of discounts was written explicitly to provide certainty and confidence to prospective customers, like this: "Stay 7 nights 50% Discount, Stay 14 nights 55% Discount, Stay 21 nights 60% Discount !!" Promos highlighting prices continue in the next section by writing stay longer, pay lower.

Promotions similar to those conducted by one of the resorts in Gianyar are also profit-oriented with an increase in market share. That is, by giving a discounted price, more and more guests are willing to come to stay and want to stay for more extended periods. The marketing strategy by offering discounts used by one of the resorts in the Tuban area reflects the direct profit-oriented marketing model. The model focuses on achieving economic aspects of both profit through revenue management by maximizing occupancy rates with relatively lower prices, such as price discrimination for customers who stay longer, for example, the Stay Longer package, and Pay Lower. This strategy is very reasonable considering the number of rooms is enormous, which is 137. According to the Director of Sales & Marketing Maca Group, Ms Putu Sariasih

"In addition to five-star and four-star hotels, three-star hotels in Bali also use the direct profit-oriented marketing model. Characteristics of prices offered by three-star hotels are cheaper than five-star and four-star hotels, so the level of competition between three-star hotels with one another is relatively high. Putu Sariasih added that between demand and supply (provider) specifically for three-star hotels in balance is not balanced. The number of requests is less than the provider, so the tendency for a price war is very large. This condition is also exacerbated because it is used by travel agents to reduce prices even cheaper. This makes the three-star Hotel very reasonable and relevant to apply the direct profit-oriented marketing model to maintain business continuity" (Source: Interview with Ms Putu Sari Asih on June 11 2020)

The second category is called the indirect profit-oriented model, a marketing model in which the communication method does not explicitly focus on economic or profit aspects but refines by highlighting ethics. According to the Director of Global Hospitality Expert, Mr Dewa Makapagal: *"The choice for hotels to implement the indirect profit-oriented model due to external considerations"* (Source: Interview with Dewa Makapagal on June 24, 2020).



There are three considerations, namely (1) there is pressure from consumers; (2) intense competition so that ethical reasons can get more attention; and (3) paradigm shift that does not make a profit the only focus but also considers environmental and social aspects. The indirect profit-oriented model group currently focuses on profit or economic aspects but uses more honest communication with customers.

Dewa Makapagal added that the rapid development of business often forced business people to pursue profits in contact with environmental and social problems, even without violating laws and regulations. One of the salient features of the indirect profit-oriented marketing model is how the hotel group in its marketing incorporates the concept of environmentally friendly, community-based tourism (CBT) and the efforts made in creating the sustainability and sustainability of its destination.

One example of a property that applies this marketing model is one of the resorts in Ubud, Gianyar. This resort uses the indirect profit-oriented marketing model by highlighting the ambience of the hotel environment, which in Ubud is allowed as "Style & Harmony, A sanctuary of serenity and sophistication in the culturally charged village of Ubud, Bali". Not the price, package or discount offered, but the harmonious environment and culture that is so strong in Ubud. Based on the Triple Bottom Line theory, promotion techniques like this have adopted aspects of social culture (people) and the environment (planet). Marketing communication was made not necessarily to focus on economic aspects but also to communicate the language of environmental balance and lift the concept of Ubud culture, which is the main attraction of the Ubud destination. This strategy can attract customers' attention, especially those who aim to come to Ubud to enjoy the beauty of nature and culture and can indirectly win the competition between other accommodation businesses in the Ubud area.

The third marketing model in this study is known as the profit mix oriented model, which is a way to communicate marketing that is similar to profit direct oriented, which has solid characteristics and focuses on economic or profit aspects but is followed by a Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) program. One of the five-star hotels in Bali in the Kuta area, Badung is included in the profit mix-oriented approach marketing model category. Facilities owned by the Hotel can directly illustrate the amount of investment issued by the owner, and the appropriately appointed manager or management is trying his best to meet the achievement of revenue targets and profits in returning the investment. Based on Agency Theory, when the owner as the principal gives authority to the manager as the agent, the agent is obliged to do things that provide benefits and improve the principal's welfare (Jansen & Meckling, 1976). Promotional communication is included in the direct profit-oriented approach that is focused on the economic aspects of achieving profit. However, on the same site and different pages, the Hotel also includes social promotions about CSR programs named Help Friends for Life. In this program, the Hotel is working with one of the foundations in Bali to help families who are less able and have health problems in Bali. Until now, the Hotel has helped more than 100 residents in Bali through donations from customers. Based on this and studies of about nine hotels in the star, resort, boutique, and glamping category, their marketing models can be divided into three groups: direct profit-oriented models, (2) indirect profit-oriented models, and (3) mix of profit-oriented models. These three models represent almost all of the accommodation business services in Bali. According to the Chairman of the Bali Sales & Marketing Community (BASCOM) Advisory Board, Ms Fransiska Handoko "Stating that the marketing model used today in Bali, one example is Marketing Mix 7P is still oriented only on the economic side, meaning that the efforts made are still limited to meeting targets or volumes that can be interpreted as simply focused on profit (profit). This will be very detrimental to Bali in the long run. What needs to be done by Bali as a solution in the future is how to balance the achievement of good economic, environmental and socio-cultural performance to avoid conditions where future generations experience problems in meeting their future needs" (Source: Interview with Ms Fransiska Handoko on April 26, 2020).

One example of a tourist area in Bali that has implemented the concept of sustainable tourism is the Sanur area. Sanur Beach is an icon famous for its flagship potential in the form



of coral reefs. Over time, the arrangement of shade trees along the coast creates a calm and comfortable atmosphere. Adjacent to the beach, the Le Mayeur Museum is also a unique attraction for tourists. The historical record displayed by the museum today is precious. The Sanur Village Foundation plays a vital role in anticipating and regulating tourism development in Sanur (Sudjana et. Al 2019). This is where the local community plays a vital role through the Sanur Village Foundation not only as a tourism stakeholder but also as a tourism shareholder.

Positive and Negative Impacts of Accommodation Marketing Models in the Tourism Industry in Bali. Entrepreneurs are responsible for maintaining harmonious relations between social, cultural, economic, and environmental, which are usually abbreviated with 3P: people, profit, planet. Every marketing model has advantages and disadvantages, strengths and weaknesses, or positive and negative impacts. The positive impact of the profit-oriented marketing model is (1) Economic Growth, (2) Achievement of Return on Investment, (3) Business Continuity, and (4) Increasing Market Share.

Bali's economic growth is supported by most tourism accommodation and restaurants, reaching 5.63% in 2019. Bali's achievement is more outstanding than the national economic growth percentage of 5.17% in the same year (Bank Indonesia, 2020). National Foreign Exchange Revenue from the tourism sector in 2019 increased by 280 trillion; the data increased from the achievements in 2018, which amounted to 270 trillion. Bali's contribution to the national foreign exchange from the tourism sector is quite significant, as can be seen from the number of tourist arrivals nationally. In 2019, the number of direct foreign tourists visiting Indonesia reached 16.1 million. Direct foreign tourist arrivals to Bali for the same year (2019) reached 6.1 million; this means that Bali contributed 40% to the national visit rate, which also means 40% to the national foreign exchange tourism sector. Bali's contribution to the national reached 40% was thanks to the cooperation between various subsectors such as travel agencies, business accommodation, tourist attractions, transportation business including national and foreign airlines, and of course because of the role of the government. Evidence of the magnitude of the influence of tourism on the Balinese economy can also be seen during the Covid-19 pandemic, when tourism plummeted, even suspended, and the Balinese economy also plummeted. In such a situation, the potential for obtaining restaurant and hotel taxes was lost at least as much as he had earned in previous years.

A profit-oriented marketing model will maintain its market share for hotel managers who understand market sensitivity. According to Dewa Makapagal, Director of Global Hospitality Expert (GHE), ideally, market share is maintained or increased so that in the long run, the company's profits will be safe or even increased (Interview 24 / June / 2020). If the entrepreneur or business manager focuses on profit, they must think about efficiency in the company so that prices can compete and achieve maximum market share. Thus, the goal's end is that the company's profit also increases.

To increase market share, we need a strategy known as the generic strategy popularized by Porter; this strategy is a fundamental way for companies to achieve profitability and a significant market share by having a sustainable competitive advantage. There are ; 1) Cost leadership strategy that is achieving cost leadership through a set of functional policies, 2) A differentiation strategy that is creating something that is perceived to be unique to the whole industry and 3) Focusing strategy that is focusing on a specific group of buyers, or geographical markets (Kotler, 2008).

The negative impacts are divided into two, there are (1) Environmental Impacts consisting of; land-use change, accommodation industry waste, plastic waste, and clean water crisis, and (2) Socio-Cultural Impacts consisting of; cultural degradation, increased crime, hegemony towards residents, and congestion. The large-scale conversion of paddy fields in Bali directly impacts the tourism industry. High economic growth causes some sectors of the economy to proliferate so that the sector requires more land. Rice fields close to economic sources will experience shifts in other forms of use such as habitations, manufacturing industries, and infrastructure facilities. Specifically, land-use change in Bali in 2017 increased by reaching 895 hectares. Of Bali's nine regencies and cities, Tabanan Regency was the highest contributor to land-use change in 2017, with 363 hectares (Ha).



Buleleng is in second place with a total area of 325 hectares. At the same time, Jembrana and Bangli have relatively no shrinkage in paddy fields. Badung experienced 38-hectare depreciation, Denpasar with an area of 35 hectares, Gianyar covering 50 hectares, Klungkung with an area of 64 hectares, and Karangasem reached 20 hectares (BPS Bali, 2017).

Hotel development can also have a positive impact in the form of increased employment. But, on the contrary. The tourism sector is also one of the sources of environmental pollution and the social impacts of the community. One of the impacts of pollution from the high number of domestic and foreign tourists visiting Bali is increased wastewater production. The availability of clean water in accommodation facilities is an essential thing that must be fulfilled in addition to other needs. As an island that attracts foreign tourists, the problem of waste in Bali is very chronic. Indonesia is the second-largest country after China contributing waste, especially at sea. Plastic waste that fills rivers and oceans has caused problems for many years.

According to data from IDEP, 65% of the water in Bali is used for tourism service needs. In 2018, the population of Bali will reach 4.2 million, while the Island of the Gods recorded 15.9 million domestic and foreign tourists, resulting in a 13.6% deficit in water demand. IDEP noted that water needs in Bali reached 5,454 million m³ / year while only 4,710 million m³ / year were available (www.idepfoundation.org, 12 / May / 2020). The clean water crisis in Bali has been happening for a long time. In addition to the weak government regulations in controlling domestic and non-domestic water, this crisis was also caused by the exploration and exploitation of groundwater due to the rapid growth of tourism on the island. Balinese culture is experiencing degradation with globalization, modernization, and tourism development. The social degradation of Balinese people comes from residential locations close to objects of global cultural propagation. The location triggers the community to develop businesses related to the needs of migrants. As a result, market demand tends to be modern and the number of foreign tourists, makes people forget the culture they have adopted so far that has changed to match the demands of migrants. Tourism can certainly provide economic added value to the lives of Balinese people, including the added value of income for the people, welfare, and education. Coupled with the issue of immigrants who make Bali as a place to try their luck and hope to get a good living, but if that expectation is also not fulfilled, there will be groups of people who commit crimes, especially against foreign tourists, be it an act of mugging, robbery and even rape. The second factor is the abuse of narcotics and illegal drugs and alcohol. The third factor is the practice of prostitution which has become two of different sides for the world of tourism. The presence of prostitution if considered in-depth and holistic because of the demand. So, if there is no request it will disappear by itself. The characteristics of the hegemony of the local community by the development of tourism is by changing the attitudes and behavior of the community, especially seen from everyday life to the religious traditions, which at first were always based on the philosophy of "Tri Hita Karana", "Rwa Bhineda" which characterizes balance and continuity with others, nature, and creator. This condition is by Antonio Gramsci's theory of hegemony, which is critical thinking to lead people or groups of people to follow what they want by using a political and ideological leadership approach based on consensus or agreement that is directly or indirectly and openly or secretly, by using components in the community (Sugiono, 2006). Increasing the number of tourists to Bali also raises new problems, namely traffic jams on the roads to tourist destinations on the Island of the Gods. Harmony is the keyword in improving the marketing model currently carried out, by referring to the triple bottom line theory, which is thinking about a business that prioritizes the preservation of nature (planet), human welfare (people), and also the opportunity to make a profit become the foundation for the survival of the company.

An Innovative Marketing Model for the Accommodation Business to Support Sustainable Tourism Development in Bali. The innovative marketing models described here differ from or refine the profit-oriented marketing model. The point is a marketing model that has the awareness to support sustainable tourism development programs in Bali. It is said to be supportive because realizing sustainable tourism is a joint effort, not only by tourism



accommodation entrepreneurs, especially marketers but by all levels of society (Putra and Paturusi eds. 2017: xiv). Before seeing an example of an application carried out by an accommodation company in Bali, the following explains the theoretical basis for innovative marketing oriented towards sustainable tourism.

Innovation is the critical word for progress. Progress not only means a change from the situation for the better but provides benefits with as few negative impacts as possible. In the context of marketing, innovation needs to be done to reduce the negative impact and increase the positive impact of the development of the tourism industry. The marketing mix is one of the popular marketing strategies in Bali and most of the marketing mix used is the 7P by the scope of the tourism accommodation business, which is services. Neil Borden first introduced the concept of the Marketing Mix or Marketing Mix in 1964 through his article entitled *The Concept of the Marketing Mix* or in Indonesian, it can be translated into the *Concept of the Marketing Mix*. Neil Borden breaks down these materials into 12 elements: product planning, price, branding (branding), distribution channels, personal selling, advertising, promotion, packaging, appearance, service, physical handling, fact-finding and analysis (Borden, 2003). 1984:9). These twelve elements were then grouped by Jerome McCarthy into four high-level categories known today as the 4P marketing mix model or 4P marketing mix. The 4P marketing mix was then further developed into the 7P marketing mix (7P marketing mix) for marketing related to services or services (McCarthy, 1960). In this study, a tourism marketing model that had been applied in Bali for the tourism accommodation business was appointed as an innovation, namely the 7P marketing mix related to services.

The sustainable marketing innovation model is a marketing model innovation that is carried out to meet the performance of all stakeholders, including customers and not ignore the interests of future generations. Its innovation by combining contemporary 7-P marketing mix is; product, price, promotion, place, participants, physical evidence and process (Booms and Bitner, 1981) with three elements of the triple bottom line (TBL) theory, namely; profit, people and planet (Jamrozy, 2007).

The combination in question does not necessarily add 7Ps to 3Ps, but the implementation of a 7P marketing mix strategy policy to achieve 3P performance. The 7P for sustainability marketing mix or 7P+ marketing mix is expected to be a solution for Balinese marketers in carrying out their marketing strategies in meeting the economic targets set by the company and without ignoring social and environmental aspects, so that business continuity can be achieved and at the same time the destination is also maintained from environmental and environmental aspects. socio-cultural. The 7P+ marketing mix essentially describes a marketing mix based on profit, people and planet performance. The 7P+ marketing mix includes product+, price+, place+, promotion+, participants+, physical evidence+, and process+ can also be found in Yoga, et al. (2020).

CONCLUSION

Based on the discussion that has been elaborated, this study concludes that the accommodation service provider industry in Bali currently mostly runs a marketing model that focuses on economic aspects or is profit-oriented. This profit-oriented marketing practice is naturally reasonable because a business will be sustainable if the company can maintain targeted profits on an ongoing basis. Nature and profit-oriented marketing practices are applied by hotels of various levels and categories, such as three to five-stars, boutique hotels to villas.

In this research, the profit-oriented marketing model is divided into three, specifically (1) a direct profit-oriented model is a marketing approach that directs its communication to business opportunities and economic aspects; (2) an indirect profit-oriented model is a marketing approach that does not directly focus on economic aspects, but rather refines with an emphasis on ethics such as environmentally friendly activities, saving culture and empowering local communities; and (3) profit-oriented mix model, which is an approach that has a similarity to direct profit-oriented, which has strong characteristics and focuses directly



on economic aspects or profits, but on the other hand promotes Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) programs.

There are several positive impacts from the profit-oriented marketing model, mainly (1) supporting the growth of the Balinese economy, including through increasing Hotel and restaurant tax revenues (PB-1); (2) assisting investors in achieving a return on investment (ROI) and stimulating other investments; (3) supporting investors for business continuity and finally the sustainability of the tourism industry and other sectors; and (4) increasing market share that makes company performance healthy and generally contributes to the growth of Bali's tourism in general.

The negative impacts of the profit-oriented marketing model can be divided into two, there are (1) environmental impacts which include: (a) acceleration of land-use change; (b) increase in accommodation industry waste; (c) an increase in plastic waste amid limited processing capacity; and (d) conflicts of interest in the use of clean water between industry and the community; and (2) socio-cultural impacts which include: (a) cultural degradation due to excessive and uncontrolled commercialization; (b) increased crime including narcotics crime as a direct result of the development of the tourism industry that goes beyond the ability to control; (c) increased local migration which results in congestion and disharmony between migrants and residents; (d) the exclusion of citizens who do not have access to the tourism economy that has the potential to cause social disparity and conflict.

Following are three suggestions, one each for the government and society as important stakeholders in the tourism industry and marketing practitioners, as well as for researchers. It is recommended for the government and the public to closely support and regulate business governance so that business objectives are in line with the 7P+ marketing spirit. The role of the government is very important, especially in making regulations and business governance. while the community as one of the tourism stakeholders can actively support the business climate by preparing citizens to become good human resources so that they have a competitive value in entering tourism economic access. As for marketing practitioners, it is advisable to transform marketing models and approaches so that their contribution to the development of sustainable Bali tourism is getting more real. The trick is to implement the 7P+ marketing model. For future research, it is recommended to continue the study on the role of marketers in supporting sustainable tourism development in Bali, because the tourism industry is very dynamic and what is considered ideal now may face new changes and challenges in the future to adapt.

REFERENCES

1. Akama, J.S and Kieti, D, 2007, "Tourism and Socio-economic Development in Developing Countries: A Case Study of Mombasa Resort in Kenya", *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, Vol. 15, No. 6, pp. 735-48.
2. Ardika, I Wayan. 2007. *Pustaka Budaya dan Pariwisata*. Denpasar:Pustaka Larasan.
3. Badan Pusat Statistik Bali. *Bali dalam angka 2017*. Bali: Badan Pusat Statistik Bali.
4. Belz, F.-M., & Peattie, K. (2010). "Sustainability marketing: An Innovative Conception of Marketing". *Marketing Review St Gallen*, Vol. 27, No.5, pp. 8-15.
5. Bendesa, I Komang Gde dan Ni Made Asti Aksari. 2017. "From Agricultural to Tourism Hegemony: A Deep Socio-Economic Structural Transformation" Dalam Sylvine Pickel-Chevalier (ed) *Tourism in Bali and the Challenge of Sustainable Development*, pp. 76-102. London: Cambridge Scholars Publishing.
6. Booms, B.H. & Bitner, M.J. 1981. *Marketing Strategies and Organizational Structures for Service Firms*.In J.H. Donnelly and W.R. George, (Eds.), *Marketing of Services* (pp. 47-51). Chicago: American Marketing Association.
7. Borden, N.H. 1984. *The Concept of Marketing Mix*. *Journal of Advertising Research*. Harvard Business School, 7-12.
8. Bramwell, Bill, Bernard Lane, Scott McCabe, Jan Mosedale & CarolineScarles. 2008. "Research Perspectives on Responsible Tourism", *Journal Of Sustainable Tourism* 16:3, 253-257.



9. Burn, P and Holder, A. 1997. "Tourism: A New Perspective" Prentice Hall International Hampstead.
10. Dewi, Ike J. 2011. Implementasi dan Implikasi Kelembagaan Pemasaran Pariwisata yang Bertanggung Jawab. Jakarta: Kementerian Kebudayaan dan Pariwisata Republik Indonesia.
11. Ghozali, I., Chariri, A., 2007. Teori Akuntansi. Badan Penerbit Universitas Diponegoro.
12. Gurtner, Yetta. 2016. "Returning to paradise: Investigating issues of tourism crisis and disaster recovery on the island of Bali", *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Management*, Vol. 28 (2016) 11-19.
13. Honey, M. & R. Gilpin. 2009. *Tourism in Developing World*, United States Institute of Peace, Washington D.C.: USA.
14. Jamrozy, Ute. 2007. *Marketing of Tourism: A Paradigm Shift toward Sustainability*. *International Journal of Culture, Tourism and Hospitality Research*. Vol. 1 No. 2, pp. 117 – 130.
15. Jauhari, Vinnie (ed). 2014. *Managing Sustainability in the Hospitality and Tourism Industry: Paradigms and Directions for the Future*. Toronto, Kanada: Apple Academic Press, Inc.
16. Jensen and Meckling, 1976, *The Theory of The Firm: Managerial Behaviour, Agency Cost, and Ownership Structure*, *Journal of Financial and Economics*, Vol. 3, pp. 305-360.
17. Kotler, Philip. 2008. *Manajemen Pemasaran Edisi 12 Jilid 2*. Jakarta: PT Indeks Kelompok Gramedia.
18. McCarthy, E.J. 1960. *Basic Marketing: A Managerial Approach*. Homewood, IL: Irwin.
19. Picard, M., 2006, *Bali Pariwisata Budaya dan Budaya Pariwisata*, Penerjemah Jean Couteau dan Warih Wiratsana, Jakarta: Kepustakaan Populer Gramedia, Forum Jakarta-Paris.
20. Pitana, G., & Gayatri, P. 2005. *Sosiologi Pariwisata Yogyakarta*: CV Andi Offset.
21. Pomeroy, A., Johnson, L., & Noble, G. 2010. Conceptualizing a contemporary marketing mix for sustainable tourism marketing. *Proceedings of the 20th Annual Conference of the Council for Australian University Tourism and Hospitality Education (CAUTHE)* (pp. 1-15). Hobart: School of Management, University of Tasmania.
22. Prior, D. et al. 2008. Are Socially Responsible Managers Really Ethical? Exploring the Relationship between Earnings Management and Corporate Social Responsibility. *Journal Compilation Vol 16 No 3*, May.
23. Putra, I Nyoman Darma dan Michael Hitchcock. 2005. "Pura Besakih: A World Heritage Site Contested", *Indonesia and The Malay World*, Vol. 33, No. 96, pp. 225-238.
24. Putra, I Nyoman Darma dan Syamsul Alam Paturusi. 2017. *Metamorfosi Pariwisata Bali, Tantangan Memabangun Pariwisata Berkelanjutan*. Denpasar: Pustaka Larasan.
25. Rahmawati, Putu Indah, Min Jiang, Alexandra Law, Agung Suryawan Wiranatha & Terry DeLacy. 2018. "Spirituality and corporate social responsibility: an empirical narrative from the Balinese tourism industry", *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, Vol. 27, No. 1, pp. 156-172.
26. Sudjana, I Made I Komang Gde Bendesa, Agung Suryawan Wiranatha. 2016. "Sanur Area Development Strategy Towards Green Tourism Destination", *Management Studies*, Sep.-Oct. 2019, Vol. 7, No. 5, 427-434. doi: 10.17265/2328-2185/2019.05.003
27. Yoga, I. A. M., Made, B., Wayan, A. I., & Suryawan, W. A. (2020). Improving the Marketing Strategy into 7PS+ for Sustainability: A Study of Bali Tourism, Indonesia. *Russian Journal of Agricultural and Socio-Economic Sciences*, 104(8), 15-23.